

**Tables to Accompany**  
*An Overview of the Summative Evaluations of*  
*Employment Benefits and Support Measures*

**Walter Nicholson**

**Results through August 2008**

**Table 1: Unemployment Rates during the EBSM evaluations**

Province	Program Period	Unemployment Rates			
		Pre-Program	Program	Post year 1	Post year 2
Alberta	1/6/01-31/5/02	5.0	4.7	5.3	5.0
British Columbia	1/4/00-31/3/03	7.9	7.1	8.2	8.2
New Brunswick	1/4/01-31/3/01	10.4	10.5	10.2	9.7
Newfoundland-Labrador	1/4/00-31/3/01	17.0	16.4	16.3	16.6
Nova Scotia	1/1/00-31/12/01	9.4	9.2	9.6	9.3
Ontario	1/4/01-31/3/02	5.8	6.6	7.0	7.0
Prince Edward Island	1/1/00-31/12/02	12.0	12.0	11.2	11.0
Quebec	1/1/00-31/12/00	9.0	8.5	8.9	8.5
Saskatchewan	1/4/03-31/12/04	5.7	5.6	5.1	5.2

Source: *HRSDC Monitoring and Assessment Report, 2006*. Annex 1.4. Some figures have been interpolated

**Table 2: Characteristics of Evaluation Participants**

<b>Province</b>	<b>Percent Active</b>	<b>Percent Female</b>	<b>Age &lt;30 (%)</b>	<b>Age 30-49 (%)</b>	<b>Age 50+ (%)</b>	<b>Ed. &lt; HS (%)</b>	<b>HS Grad (%)</b>	<b>Post HS (%)</b>	<b>Univ. Grad (%)</b>
<b>Alberta</b>	<b>62</b>	<b>54</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>61</b>	<b>23</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>52</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>British Columbia</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>17</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>23</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>23</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>New Brunswick</b>	<b>66</b>	<b>43</b>	<b>35</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>49</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Newfoundland</b>	<b>71</b>	<b>37</b>	<b>41</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>
<b>Nova Scotia</b>	<b>80</b>	<b>36</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>41</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>Ontario</b>	<b>73</b>	<b>43</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>59</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>28</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Prince Edward Island</b>	<b>83</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>46</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Saskatchewan</b>	<b>53</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>35</b>	<b>53</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>35</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>14</b>

*Source:* Statistics taken from various evaluation final reports. NA – Not Available

**Table 3: Estimated Impacts for Skills Development (SD)**

	Alberta <sup>1</sup>	British Columbia	New Brunswick	Newfoundland	Nova Scotia <sup>2</sup>	Prince Edward I <sup>2</sup> .	Ontario	Quebec	Saskatchewan <sup>3</sup>
<b>Active Claimants</b>									
<b>Annual Hours</b>	N/A	+211*	+6	+104	N/A	N/A	+54	+147	N/A
<b>%</b>		+17	0	+8			+4	+12	
<b>Annual Earnings</b>	+4796*	+3313*	+2700*	+1985*	+2936*	+1057	-402	+1690	N/A
<b>%</b>	+24	+17	+14	+10	+15	+7	-2	+8	
<b>Annual EI Weeks</b>	-1.2*	+1.8*	-1.4	-2.2*	+1.8*	+0.5	-3.0*	+1.0	-2.0*
<b>%</b>	-8	+12	-9	-15	+12	+3	-20	+6	-13
<b>Former Claimants</b>									
<b>Annual Hours</b>	+117*	-235*	+87	-79	N/A	N/A	+28	+342*	N/A
<b>%</b>	+12	-24	+9	-8			+3	+34	
<b>Annual Earnings</b>	N/A	-3868*	+3300	-318	N/A	N/A	+906	+5276*	N/A
<b>%</b>		-24	+21	-2			+6	+33	
<b>Annual EI Weeks</b>	N/A	-0.1	+4.3*	-0.8	N/A	N/A	+0.4	-2.5*	N/A
<b>%</b>		-1	+30	-5			+3	-17	

\* Impact significantly different from zero at .05 level of significance.

<sup>1</sup> Alberta reported only statistically significant results.

<sup>2</sup> Nova Scotia and Prince Edward Island did not report intervention-specific results separately for Active and Former Claimants – combined outcomes are reported here under “Active Claimants”.

<sup>3</sup>Saskatchewan did not report hours and earnings estimates separately by intervention, primarily because of sample size constraints. EI impacts were combined for both active and former claimants, but are included here under “Active Claimants”.

**Table 4: Estimated Impacts for Targeted Wage Subsidies (TWS)**

	Alberta <sup>1</sup>	British Columbia	New Brunswick	Newfoundland	Nova Scotia <sup>2</sup>	Prince Edward I. <sup>2</sup>	Ontario	Quebec	Saskatchewan <sup>3</sup>
<b>Active Claimants</b>									
<b>Annual Hours</b>	N/A	+296*	+28	-74	N/A	N/A	+74	+88	N/A
<b>%</b>		+24	+2	-6			+6	+7	
<b>Annual Earnings</b>	+4180*	+2699	+600	-2141	+4791*	+447	-636	+1	N/A
<b>%</b>	+21	+14	+3	-11	+24	+2	-3	0	
<b>Annual EI Weeks</b>	N/A	+1.0*	+0.1	-2.0	-1.8*	+1.2	-1.6*	+2.7*	+0.2
<b>%</b>		+7	0	-13	-12	+8	-11	+18	+1
<b>Former Claimants</b>									
<b>Annual Hours</b>	N/A	+328*	+419*	N/A	N/A	N/A	+275*	+194*	N/A
<b>%</b>		+33	+42				+27	+19	
<b>Annual Earnings</b>	N/A	+3194*	+2100	N/A	N/A	N/A	+2811*	+2642*	N/A
<b>%</b>		+20	+13				+18	+17	
<b>Annual EI Weeks</b>	N/A	+0.2*	+8.5*	N/A	N/A	N/A	+1.6*	+2.7*	N/A
<b>%</b>		+1	+57				+11	+18	

\* Impact significantly different from zero at .05 level of significance.

<sup>1</sup> Alberta reported only statistically significant results.

<sup>2</sup> Nova Scotia and Prince Edward Island did not report intervention-specific results separately for Active and Former Claimants – combined outcomes are reported here under “Active Claimants”.

<sup>3</sup>Saskatchewan did not report hours and earnings estimates separately by intervention, primarily because of sample size constraints. EI impacts were combined for both active and former claimants, but are included here under “Active Claimants”.

**Table 5: Estimated Impacts for Self Employment (SE)**

	Alberta <sup>1</sup>	British Columbia	New Brunswick	Newfoundland	Nova Scotia <sup>2</sup>	Prince Edward I. <sup>2</sup>	Ontario	Quebec	Saskatchewan <sup>3</sup>
<b>Active Claimants</b>									
Annual Hours	+168*	+456*	+1743*	-65	N/A	N/A	+347*	+558*	N/A
%	+13	+36	+76	-5			+28	+45	
Annual Earnings	N/A	-466*	-12,200*	-3711	+4461*	N/A	+590	-3440	N/A
%		-2	-60	-19	+23		+3	-17	
Annual EI Weeks	-1.3*	0	-11.8*	-16.4*	-4.5*	N/A	-5.8*	-1.5*	N/A
%	-9	0	-79	-109	-30		-39	-10	
<b>Former Claimants</b>									
Annual Hours	N/A	+229*	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	+372*	+1087*	N/A
%		+23					+37	+56	
Annual Earnings	N/A	-2617*	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	+330	+4645*	N/A
%		-16					+2	+29	
Annual EI Weeks	N/A	-2.6*	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	-2.2*	-4.0*	N/A
%		-17					-15	-27	

\* Impact significantly different from zero at .05 level of significance.

<sup>1</sup> Alberta reported only statistically significant results.

<sup>2</sup> Nova Scotia and Prince Edward Island did not report intervention-specific results separately for Active and Former Claimants – combined outcomes are reported here under “Active Claimants”.

<sup>3</sup>Saskatchewan did not report hours and earnings estimates separately by intervention, primarily because of sample size constraints. EI impacts were combined for both active and former claimants, but are included here under “Active Claimants”.

**Table 6: Estimated Impacts for Job Creation Partnerships (JCP)**

	Alberta <sup>1</sup>	British Columbia	New Brunswick	Newfoundland	Nova Scotia <sup>2</sup>	Prince Edward I. <sup>2</sup>	Ontario	Quebec	Saskatchewan <sup>3</sup>
<b>Active Claimants</b>									
Annual Hours	N/A	+285*	N/A	+16	N/A	N/A	+2	N/A	N/A
%		+23		+1			0		
Annual Earnings	+3565*	+2327	N/A	+47	+647	N/A	-2471*	N/A	N/A
%	+18	+12		0	+3		-12		
Annual EI Weeks	N/A	0	N/A	-0.5	+1.2	N/A	-0.4	N/A	N/A
%		0		-3	+8		-3		
<b>Former Claimants</b>									
Annual Hours	N/A	+85*	N/A	-259*	N/A	N/A	+133	N/A	N/A
%		+9		-26			+13		
Annual Earnings	-3750*	-2103*	N/A	-2671*	N/A	N/A	+2159	N/A	N/A
%	-24	-13		-17			+14		
Annual EI Weeks	N/A	+0.1	N/A	-0.8	N/A	N/A	+1.5*	N/A	N/A
%		+1		-5			+10		

\* Impact significantly different from zero at .05 level of significance.

<sup>1</sup> Alberta reported only statistically significant results.

<sup>2</sup> Nova Scotia and Prince Edward Island did not report intervention-specific results separately for Active and Former Claimants – combined outcomes are reported here under “Active Claimants”.

<sup>3</sup>Saskatchewan did not report hours and earnings estimates separately by intervention, primarily because of sample size constraints. EI impacts were combined for both active and former claimants, but are included here under “Active Claimants”.

**Table 7: Estimated Impacts for Employment Assistance Services<sup>+</sup> (EAS)**

	Alberta <sup>1</sup>	British Columbia	New Brunswick	Newfoundland	Nova Scotia <sup>2</sup>	Prince Edward I. <sup>2</sup>	Ontario	Quebec	Saskatchewan <sup>3</sup>
Active Claimants									
Annual Hours	N/A	+49	-7	+44	N/A	N/A	+60	-44	N/A
%		+4	-1	+4			+5	-4	
Annual Earnings	N/A	+37	-1,000	-480	N/A	N/A	-628	-1900	N/A
%		0	-5	-2			-3	-9	
Annual EI Weeks	N/A	+5.6*	+2.1	-0.7	N/A	N/A	-1.0	+4.0*	-1.6*
%		+37	+14	-5			-7	+27	-11

\* Impact significantly different from zero at .05 level of significance.

<sup>+</sup> EAS results are shown only for Active Claimants – see text.

<sup>1</sup> Alberta reported only statistically significant results.

<sup>2</sup> Nova Scotia and Prince Edward Island did not report intervention-specific results separately for Active and Former Claimants – combined outcomes are reported here under “Active Claimants”.

<sup>3</sup> Saskatchewan did not report hours and earnings estimates separately by intervention, primarily because of sample size constraints. EI impacts were combined for both active and former claimants, but are included here under “Active Claimants”.



**Table 8: A Simplified Benefit-Cost Accounting Framework**

<b>Perspective</b>	<b>Society</b>	<b>Participant</b>	<b>Government (all others)</b>
<b>Benefits</b>			
<b>Increased Earnings</b>	<b>+X</b>	<b>+X</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Taxes Paid</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-X</b>	<b>+X</b>
<b>Non-monetary gains</b>	<b>+X</b>	<b>+X</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Reduced transfers</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-X</b>	<b>+X</b>
<b>Costs</b>			
<b>Program resource costs</b>	<b>-X</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-X</b>
<b>Program transfer costs</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>+X</b>	<b>-X</b>
<b>Out-of-pocket costs</b>	<b>-X</b>	<b>-X</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Opportunity costs</b>	<b>-X</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-X</b>
<b>Taxes on O.C.</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>+X</b>	<b>-X</b>

**Table 9: Reported Costs of Interventions for Active Claimants**

	Alberta	British Columbia	New Brunswick	Newfoundland	Nova Scotia	Prince Edward Island	Ontario	Quebec	Saskatchewan
<b>Program Costs</b>									
SD	\$8,820	\$4,799	\$8,458	\$4,768	\$7,282	\$6,748	\$7,778	\$11,224	\$4,629
TWS	\$5,864	\$3,400	\$3,795	\$5,908	\$5,025	\$6,017	\$3,997	\$6,203	\$3,850
SE	\$5,680	\$10,003	\$9,028	\$7,666	\$11,746	N/A	\$13,690	\$9,475	N/A
JCP	\$5,690	\$7,249	N/A	\$3,699	\$9,490	N/A	\$13,622	\$5,204	\$3,850
EAS	\$847	\$396	\$794	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$948	\$1,774	\$523
<b>Out-of-Pocket Costs</b>									
SD	N/A	\$2,130	N/A	\$1,595	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
TWS	N/A	\$647	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
SE	N/A	\$4,591	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
JCP	N/A	\$445	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
EAS	N/A	\$453	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
<b>Opportunity Costs</b>									
SD	N/A	\$2,712	\$6,462	\$5,808	N/A	N/A	\$6,971	N/A	\$625
TWS	N/A	\$1,069	-\$3,105	\$3,749	N/A	N/A	\$3,758	N/A	\$694
SE	N/A	\$1,685	\$10,793	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$3,693	N/A	N/A
JCP	N/A	-\$279	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$6,721	N/A	\$694
EAS	N/A	\$233	\$2,894	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1,299	N/A	\$760

**Table 10: Illustration of Benefit/Cost Analysis for Skills Development**

<b>Perspective</b>	<b>Society</b>	<b>Participant</b>	<b>Government (all others)</b>
<b>Benefits</b>			
Increased Earnings	<b>+\$9,000</b>	<b>+\$9,000</b>	<b>0</b>
Taxes Paid	<b>0</b>	<b>-\$2,250</b>	<b>+\$2,250</b>
Non-monetary gains	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
Reduced transfers	<b>0</b>	<b>-\$1,000</b>	<b>+\$1,000</b>
<b>Costs</b>			
Program resource costs	<b>-\$6,000</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-\$6,000</b>
Program transfer costs	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
Out-of-pocket costs	<b>-\$2,000</b>	<b>-\$2,000</b>	<b>0</b>
Opportunity costs	<b>-\$4,000</b>	<b>-\$4,000</b>	<b>0</b>
Taxes on O.C.	<b>0</b>	<b>+\$1,000</b>	<b>-\$1,000</b>
<b>Benefits - Costs</b>	<b>-\$3,000</b>	<b>+\$750</b>	<b>-\$3,750</b>

**Table 11: Illustration of Benefit/Cost Analysis for Targeted Wage Subsidies**

<b>Perspective</b>	<b>Society</b>	<b>Participant</b>	<b>Government (all others)</b>
<b>Benefits</b>			
<b>Increased Earnings</b>	<b>+\$8,000</b>	<b>+\$8,000</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Taxes Paid</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-\$2,000</b>	<b>+\$2,000</b>
<b>Non-monetary gains</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Reduced transfers</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Costs</b>			
<b>Program resource costs</b>	<b>-\$500</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-\$500</b>
<b>Program transfer costs</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>+\$3,375</b>	<b>-\$3,375</b>
<b>Out-of-pocket costs</b>	<b>-\$650</b>	<b>-\$650</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Opportunity costs</b>	<b>-\$1,000</b>	<b>-\$1,000</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Taxes on O.C.</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>+\$250</b>	<b>-\$250</b>
<b>Benefits - Costs</b>	<b>+\$5,850</b>	<b>+\$7,975</b>	<b>-\$3,125</b>

**Table 12: Illustration of Benefit/Cost Analysis for Self Employment**

<b>Perspective</b>	<b>Society</b>	<b>Participant</b>	<b>Government (all others)</b>
<b>Benefits</b>			
Increased Earnings	<b>-\$8,000</b>	<b>-\$8,000</b>	<b>0</b>
Taxes Paid	<b>0</b>	<b>+\$2,000</b>	<b>-\$2,000</b>
Non-monetary gains	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
Reduced transfers	<b>0</b>	<b>-\$5,000</b>	<b>+\$5,000</b>
<b>Costs</b>			
Program resource costs	<b>-\$3,000</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>-\$3,000</b>
Program transfer costs	<b>0</b>	<b>+\$7,000</b>	<b>-\$7,000</b>
Out-of-pocket costs	<b>-\$4,600</b>	<b>-\$4,600</b>	<b>0</b>
Opportunity costs	<b>-\$2,600</b>	<b>-\$2,600</b>	<b>0</b>
Taxes on O.C.	<b>0</b>	<b>+\$650</b>	<b>-\$650</b>
<b>Benefits - Costs</b>	<b>-\$18,200</b>	<b>-\$10,550</b>	<b>-\$7,650</b>

**Table 13: Illustration of Benefit/Cost Analysis for Job Creation Partnerships**

<b>Perspective</b>	<b>Society</b>	<b>Participant</b>	<b>Government (all others)</b>
<b>Benefits</b>			
Increased Earnings	\$4,000	\$4,000	0
Taxes Paid	0	-\$1,000	+\$1,000
Non-monetary gains	0	0	0
Reduced transfers	0	-\$1,000	+\$1,000
<b>Costs</b>			
Program resource costs <sup>1</sup>	\$1,500	0	+\$1,500
Program transfer costs	0	\$4,000	-\$4,000
Out-of-pocket costs	-\$450	-\$450	0
Opportunity costs	-\$3,000	-\$3,000	0
Taxes on O.C.	0	\$750	-\$750
<b>Benefits - Costs</b>	<b>\$2,050</b>	<b>\$3,300</b>	<b>-\$1,250</b>

<sup>1</sup> Includes assumed value of JCP output of \$4,000

**Table 14: Illustration of Benefit/Cost Analysis for Employment Assistance Services**

<b>Perspective</b>	<b>Society</b>	<b>Participant</b>	<b>Government (all others)</b>
<b>Benefits</b>			
<b>Increased Earnings</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	
<b>Taxes Paid</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Non-monetary gains</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	
<b>Reduced transfers</b>		<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Costs</b>			
<b>Program resource costs<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>\$600</b>		<b>\$600</b>
<b>Program transfer costs</b>			
<b>Out-of-pocket costs</b>	<b>\$450</b>	<b>\$450</b>	
<b>Opportunity costs</b>	<b>\$500</b>	<b>\$500</b>	
<b>Taxes on O.C.</b>			
<b>Benefits - Costs</b>	<b>-\$1550</b>	<b>-\$950</b>	<b>-\$600</b>

**Table A.1: Estimated Impacts on Annual Social Assistance Receipts<sup>+</sup>**

	Alberta <sup>1</sup>	British Columbia	New Brunswick	Newfoundland	Nova Scotia	Prince Edward I.	Ontario	Quebec	Saskatchewan
<b>Former Claimants</b>									
<b>SD</b>	N/A	+\$19	+\$360	-153	N/A	N/A	+\$18	-\$52	N/A
<b>TWS</b>	N/A	-\$521*	-\$140	N/A	N/A	N/A	-\$121*	-\$135*	N/A
<b>SE</b>	N/A	-\$110	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	-\$130*	-\$70	N/A
<b>JCP</b>	-\$300*	-\$599*	N/A	-\$327	N/A	N/A	+\$104	N/A	N/A

\* Impact significantly different from zero at .05 level of significance.

<sup>+</sup> Results are shown only for Former Claimants – see text.

<sup>1</sup> Alberta reported only statistically significant results.